Deciphering Front-Side Complex Formation in $S_N2$ Reactions via Dynamics Mapping

István Szabó,*,† Balázs Olasz,‡ and Gábor Czapó*§

†Department of Chemistry, King’s College London, London SE1 1DB, United Kingdom
‡Department of Physical Chemistry and Materials Science, Institute of Chemistry, University of Szeged, Rerrich Béla tér 1, Szeged H-6720, Hungary

Supporting Information

ABSTRACT: Due to their importance in organic chemistry, the atomistic understanding of bimolecular nucleophilic substitution ($S_N2$) reactions shows exponentially growing interest. In this publication, the effect of front-side complex (FSC) formation is uncovered via quasi-classical trajectory computations combined with a novel analysis method called trajectory orthogonal projection (TOP). For both $F^- + CH_3Y$ [$Y = Cl, I$] reactions, the lifetime distributions of the $F^-⋯YCH_3$ front-side complex revealed weakly trapped nucleophiles ($F^-$). However, only the $F^- + CH_3I$ reaction features strongly trapped nucleophiles in the front-side region of the prereaction well. Interestingly, both the back-side and front-side attack show propensity to long-lived FSC formation. Spatial distributions of the nucleophile demonstrate more prominent FSC formation in case of the $F^- + CH_3I$ reaction compared to $F^- + CH_3Cl$. The presence of front-side intermediates and the broad spatial distribution in the back-side region may explain the indirect nature of the $F^- + CH_3I$ reaction.

On-dipole bimolecular nucleophilic substitution ($S_N2$) is among the most prevalent reaction pathways in chemistry and biochemistry. However, unlike what is suggested in organic chemistry textbooks, the dynamics of these reactions are quite complex. A general overall $S_N2$ reaction can be written as $Nu^- + CH_3Y \rightarrow CH_3Nu + Y^-$, where $Nu^-$ and $Y$ denote the attacking nucleophile and the leaving group, respectively. Potential energy landscape for this family of reactions is comprised of a central barrier that separates the pre- and postreaction wells. According to our current atomistic understanding, reactive events usually begin with the attack of the $Nu^-$ nucleophile on the methyl side of $CH_3Y$ forming ion-dipole ($Nu^-⋯H,CY$) and/or hydrogen-bonded ($Nu^-⋯HCH_3Y$) prereaction complexes, then the system goes through the central transition state [$Nu^-CH_3-Y]^+$, where synchronously a new $Nu-C$ bond forms and the $C-Y$ bond breaks, while the umbrella motion around the $sp^3$ carbon center inverts the configuration. At higher translational energies, the endothermic H-abstraction and the front-side attack channels open. The later pathway leads to retention of the final configuration, as well as the double-inversion mechanism revealed by our dynamics simulations in gas phase and recently also confirmed in aqueous solution.

Recently, the $F^- + CH_3Cl$ and $F^- + CH_3I$ $S_N2$ reactions were probed with combined crossed-beam imaging and molecular dynamics simulations, providing interesting clues to the overall dynamics of $S_N2$ reactions at an atomistic level. Both reactions are highly exothermic and characterized by a similar potential energy landscape with a $C_3$-symmetric H-bonded complex in the entrance channel together with the traditional close-lying ion-dipole complex of $C_{vi}$ symmetry connected by a low-barrier transition state. Despite these similarities, the dynamics of the two reactions showed substantial differences, which indicated the influence of the leaving group in the $S_N2$ mechanism even in the entrance channel. In the case of the $F^- + CH_3Cl$ $S_N2$ reaction, we found that, at low collision energies, the indirect mechanism dominates, whereas at higher collision energies the reaction mainly occurs via the direct rebound mechanism. By contrast, for the $F^- + CH_3I$ $S_N2$ reaction, a major contribution of the indirect mechanism to the total cross-section was observed at all collision energies investigated supported by the product velocity, scattering angle, and product internal energy distributions. These unexpected qualitative differences were putatively explained based on the differences in dipole moments, which might affect the orientation of the reactants. However, the observed changes in mechanism were not completely clarified. Very recently, Xie and Hase envisioned in their perspective article the determining role of the front-side complexes to suppress back-side attack and the roundabout mechanism accordingly. Front-side complexes have been recognized for assisting in dihalide formation in the $F^- + CF_2Br$, $F^- + CF_2I$, and $Cl^- + CF_2Br$ reactions. Detailed unimolecular dynamics with lifetime distributions were determined for the $OH^-⋯ICH_3$ front-side complex by Hase and co-workers. Moreover, front-side complexes (FSCs) were proposed to explain the

Received: May 19, 2017
Accepted: June 9, 2017
Published: June 9, 2017
indirect nature of several prototypical SN2 reactions, e.g., \( \text{OH}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{I} \),\(^{17-19} \) and \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{I} \),\(^{13} \) but the exact causes of the observed differences in the mechanism remained unclear. Our aim is to provide a detailed characterization of the structure and energetics of the \( \text{Nu}^- \cdots \text{YCH}_3 \) \( \text{[Nu} = \text{F,Cl,Br,I; Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) front-side complex minima and to explore the fascinating mechanistic roles of these intermediate ion–dipole complexes on the example of the prototypical \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y} \) \( \text{[Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) SN2 reactions. Of particular interest is the time-scale of the trapping in the front-side prereaction well.

Potential energy surfaces of the \( \text{Nu}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y} \) \( \text{[Nu} = \text{F,Cl,Br,I; Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) FSC minima are given in the Supporting Information.

**Figure 1.** Structure and energetics of front-side complex (FSC) minima. (a) Structural parameters and energies relative to the \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y(eq)} \) \( \text{[Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) reactant asymptote obtained at the CCSD(T)-F12b/aug-cc-pVTZ(-PP) level of theory. (c–f) Entrance channel interaction potential energy scans of \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y(eq)} \) \( \text{[Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) performed at the CCSD(T)-F12b/aug-cc-pVDZ(-PP) level of theory; the energies are relative to the \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y(eq)} \) reactant asymptote. (b) Definition of the potential energy surface scan. The structural parameters and relative energies of \( \text{Nu}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y} \) \( \text{[Nu} = \text{F,Cl,Br,I; Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) FSC minima are given in the Supporting Information.

Potential energy surfaces of the \( \text{Nu}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Y} \) \( \text{[Nu} = \text{F,Cl,Br,I; Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) reactions feature a potential energy well in the front-side region, i.e., in close proximity of the leaving group. Relative energies of the corresponding minima strongly depend on the nucleophile and also the leaving group. As shown in Figure 1a, the \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{I} \) reaction has a front-side complex with a potential energy minimum of \(-22.8 \text{ kcal mol}^{-1}\), relative to the reactants, and the equivalent FSC minimum for the \( \text{F}^- + \text{CH}_3\text{Cl} \) reaction is only \(-2.7 \text{ kcal mol}^{-1}\), whereas the corresponding values on our chemically accurate analytical potential energy surfaces (PESs) are \(-22.6 \text{ and } -3.7 \text{ kcal mol}^{-1}\), respectively.\(^{13} \) Considering all the possible \( \text{Nu}^- \cdots \text{YCH}_3 \) \( \text{[Nu} = \text{F,Cl,Br,I; Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \) front-side minima (shown in Figure S1) the \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{ICH}_3 \) has the deepest minimum, followed by the \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{BrCH}_3 \) and \( \text{Cl}^- \cdots \text{ICH}_3 \) complexes characterized by a potential energy minimum of \(-10.7 \text{ and } -9.2 \text{ kcal mol}^{-1}\), respectively. Note that the aforementioned \( \text{OH}^- \cdots \text{ICH}_3 \) long-lived intermediate complex is characterized by an even deeper potential minimum of \(-26.1 \text{ kcal mol}^{-1}\), predicted by DFT-based methods.\(^{17} \) (The corresponding value is \(-24.1 \text{ kcal mol}^{-1}\) at the CCSD(T)-F12b/aug-cc-pVTZ(-PP) level of theory.)

Regarding the structure of \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{YCH}_3 \) \( \text{[Y} = \text{Cl,Br,I]} \), the \text{F}–\text{Cl} bond length is 0.191 Å longer than the \text{F}–\text{I} distance. The \text{Cl}–\text{C}/\text{I}–\text{C} bond length in \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{YCH}_3 \) \( \text{[Y} = \text{Cl,I]} \) is 0.006/0.077 Å shorter than the corresponding bond in \( \text{CH}_3\text{Cl}/\text{CH}_3\text{I} \). According to the Natural Bond Orbital population analysis of \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{YCH}_3 \) \( \text{[Y} = \text{Cl,I]} \), the \text{Cl} and \text{I} atoms carry a partial charge of +0.02 and +0.25, respectively, whereas the \text{H} atoms carry +0.16 for both front-side intermediates. In contrast to the \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{ICH}_3 \) ion-dipole complex, the negative charge is distributed disproportionately between the \text{F} and \text{C} atoms of the \( \text{F}^- \cdots \text{ClCH}_3 \) complex with \(-0.97 \text{ and } -0.52\), respectively.
As we know, the trajectories may avoid even the deep potential minimum, thus we cannot rely solely on the potential energy landscapes. Therefore, we are proposing an alternative approach, called trajectory orthogonal projection (TOP), to visualize and to quantify the nucleophilic attack in the entrance channel. One should emphasize that TOP is capable of revealing reaction channels that are unlikely to follow the minimum energy path predicted by the potential energy landscape.

With analytical potential energy functions at hand for both \( F^- + CH_3Y \rightarrow CH_3F + Y^- \) reactions, \( Y = Cl, I \), we have a unique starting point to obtain statistically accurate spatial probability distributions. To shed light on the effective dynamics of these reactions, the TOP method has been applied to the entrance channel of all the reactive \( S_n2 \) trajectories by imposing the following constraints on the internal coordinates of \( CH_3Y \): \( r_{C-Y} < 3.5 \, \text{Å} \), \( r_{C-H} < 2.5 \, \text{Å} \) and \( \max (r_{C-H}) < 2.5 \, \text{Å} \) in order to avoid interference with the \( S_n2 \) exit-channel and the proton-abstraction pathway. (Note that the barrier of halogen abstraction is usually much higher than the maximum collision energy in this study.) In Figure 2 the normalized spatial probability of the attacking \( Nu^- \) around \( CH_3Y \) \( (Y = Cl, I) \) is shown at a collision energy of 1 kcal mol\(^{-1}\). On one hand, the distributions corresponding to the two reactions bear similarities in the back-side region, where both reactions show a characteristic peak, which centers (red spot) on the \( C_3 \) axis of \( CH_3Y \) \( (Y = Cl, I) \) at a \( Nu^- \cdot Y \) distance equal to...
An approach for investigating the time-scale of nucleophile capture is to consider the fraction of the trajectory spent in the FSC region. Considering the shape of the interaction potential, as well as the spatial distribution of the nucleophile, the lifetime of the individual capture events is calculated from the trajectory integration times in the $r^+_{Nu,Y}$ region, where $r^+_{Nu,Y}$ is the distance from the trapped Nu$^-$ to the Y halogen atom. We should emphasize that our definition for the front-side region is not limited to the close proximity of the Y halogen atom, because, after inspection of many trajectories, we had to realize that the trapped trajectories span a long-range region of the configurational space. Nevertheless, the exact separation of the temporally and strongly trapped trajectory segments is not straightforward. Although, this difficulty may eventually be overcome by analyzing the residence time of the F$^-$ ion in the FSC region. As seen in Figure 3a,b, the lifetime distribution of individual front-side complexation events features two regions. Up to 4 and 2 ps for F$^-$+CH$_3$I and F$^-$+ClCH$_3$, respectively, the short-lived transient complexes are represented by high probability peaks, but the probability instead of dropping to zero extends to very large life times, denoted with $t_{FSC,max}$, especially in case of the F$^-$ + CH$_3$I reaction. These long-lived, strongly trapped complexes have an isotropic lifetime distribution up to $t_{FSC,max}$ not shown on the graphs and show little collision energy ($E_{coll}$) dependence at moderate reactant translational energies. To track the differences in lifetime distributions for the two systems, we performed quasi-

The sum of $r_{Y-C_{eq}}$ and $r_{C-Nu_{eq}}$ distances in the YCH$_3$...Nu$^-$ prereaction ion--dipole complex. As also expected, a higher probability region emerges on the 2D map in close proximity of the H atom as an indicator of the extensive YH$_2$CH...Nu$^-$ H-bonded complex formation. It is noteworthy that the Nu$^-$ probability distribution in the BSC region is broader in the case of the F$^-$ + CH$_3$I reaction, which is consistent with the larger $b_{max}$ values for this S$_2$2 reaction. This increased chance for energy redistribution between the inter- and intramolecular modes of the prereaction complex may be a principal recipient of the more pronounced indirect nature of the F$^-$ + CH$_3$I S$_2$2 reaction. On the other hand, in the front-side region, the difference in Nu$^-$ spatial distributions is striking. The F$^-$ + CH$_3$I reaction features a prominent peak corresponding to the position of F$^-$ in the F$^-$...ICH$_3$ front-side ion--dipole complex; however, in case of the F$^-$ + CH$_3$Cl reaction, the spatial distribution of F$^-$ is completely isotropic in the front-side region. These findings are in line with the characteristics of the interaction potentials. The probability distributions for both reactions are qualitatively the same up to a collision energy of 15.9 kcal mol$^{-1}$ (see Figure S3–S). At higher collision energies (Figure S6) the reaction is mainly direct, suppressing the orientation effects, thus only those reactants lead to products, which start with back-side attack. Moreover, the dominant direct roundabout mechanism hinders the formation of ion--dipole and H-bonded complexes, and results in backward scattered products.

Figure 3. (a,b) Front-side complex lifetime distributions for the F$^-$ + CH$_3$Y [Y = Cl,I] S$_2$2 reactions at different collision energies. The lifetime is calculated from the trajectory integration time spent by the F$^-$ nucleophile in the front-side region defined as $r^+_{Nu,Y} < 0$, where $r^+_{Nu,Y}$ is the distance of F$^-$ from the Y leaving group after TOP. (c,d) Front-side complex lifetime fractions split into the individual contribution of trajectories starting with front-side attack (FSA) and back-side attack (BSA). The FSA and BSA trajectories are distinguished based on the initial attack angle defined as the angle between the C–Y vector and the velocity vector of CH$_3$Ya at $t = 0$. Furthermore, the FSA and BSA are split into the contribution of short-lived (transient) and long-lived (strongly trapped) FSC trajectories. The latter ones are characterized by a lifetime larger than 2 and 4 ps for Y = Cl and Y = I, respectively.
classical trajectory (QCT) simulations with Cl of mass 127 au (corresponding to I) using the $F^- + CH_3Cl$ PES.\textsuperscript{25} As predicted before,\textsuperscript{9} the mass-scaling has only minor effects on the lifetime distribution and $f_{\text{FSC,max}}$, thereby underpinning the role of the interaction potential. Considering the partitioning of the total life between short-lived and long-lived FSCs, the two reactions differ dramatically. Interestingly, the strongly trapped $F^- + CH_3I$ trajectories constitute only about 1% of the FSC events; but it is truly impressive that they accumulate $\sim 35\%$ of the total FSC lifetime at a collision energy of 1.0 kcal mol\textsuperscript{$-1$} and $\sim 55\%$ at 15.9 kcal mol\textsuperscript{$-1$} considering the back-side and front-side attack trajectories together. Since the reaction becomes more direct at higher collision energies, the fractions of lifetime corresponding to BSA trajectories are also increased. In the case of the $F^- + CH_3Cl$ reaction, the fraction of long-lived trajectories is almost negligible, and the $E_{\text{coll}}$ dependence of the lifetime fractions shows a trend similar to that of the $F^- + CH_3I$ system.

Representative trajectories presented in Figure 4 hold evidence for formation of the front-side intermediate complex on the example of the $F^- + CH_3I$ reaction at $E_{\text{coll}} = 2$ kcal mol\textsuperscript{$-1$}. As seen in panel a, even trajectories starting with back-side attack (red arrow) can easily get around the polyatomic reactant, CH$_3$I, and after spending a short time in the front-side well can lead to reactive event. Another typical trajectory is shown in panels b and c, projected to the \{I,C,H(red)\} plane and to the plane perpendicular to \{I,C,H(red)\}, respectively. Here, the $F^-$ nucleophile approaches CH$_3$I from the halogen side, and it is immediately captured in the front-side well for 42.1 ps. Note that this residence time is approximately 20 times larger than the trajectory integration time of a complete rebound or stripping process, and it is comparable with the time-scale of the indirect mechanism.\textsuperscript{8,12,13} After dissociation of the $F^-$–ICH$_3$ intermediate complex, the $F^-$ ion leaves the front-side region being trapped for a short time in the back-side region of the prereaction well. Once its relative orientation to the permanent dipole becomes appropriate, the substitution event can take place by simultaneous C–F bond formation and C–I bond rupture.

Although front-side intermediates assume a nonreactive ion-dipole orientation, the dynamics of $S_2\text{A}$ reactions at low collision energies is partially controlled by the nucleophile capture in the front-side region of the prereaction well. At the high collision energy regime ($>35$ kcal mol\textsuperscript{$-1$}), the probability of finding front-side complexes is lower, because the FSC formation is suppressed, leading to shorter life times. We can conclude that FSC formation is a principal component of the indirect mechanism. It will be of great interest to investigate the effect of mode-specific excitation on the migration of the Nu$^{-}$ in the prereaction well, and quantum dynamics studies are also highly desired to analyze the resonant states in the front-side region.\textsuperscript{24} In a wider context, the present proof of principle application of the TOP method is a solid starting point to reveal reaction pathways and thoroughly understand the effective dynamics of the fundamentally important $S_2\text{A}$ reactions using dynamics mapping.

### COMPUTATIONAL METHODS

All the \textit{ab initio} electronic structure computations (geometry optimizations, frequency computations, and potential energy surface scans) were carried out by the Molpro 2015.1 program,\textsuperscript{25} except the computation of the molecular orbitals and the Natural Bond Orbital (NBO) population analysis, which were done with the Gaussian 09 program package.\textsuperscript{26} QCT computations for the $F^- + CH_3Y$ [Y = Cl,I] reactions were performed with our in-house computer code using the recently developed analytical \textit{ab initio} potential energy surfaces.\textsuperscript{8,13} The vibrational ground state of the polyatomic reactants CH$_3$Y [Y = Cl,I] was prepared by normal mode sampling and their rotational temperature was set to 0 K. The initial orientation of CH$_3$Y [Y = Cl,I] was randomly sampled and the distance between the centers of mass of the reactants was $(x^2 + b^2)^{1/2}$, where $b$ is the impact parameter and $x$ was 30/40, 20/30, 20/30, 20/20, and 20/20 bohrs for Y = Cl/I at collision energies of 1, 2, 4, 10, and 15.9 kcal mol\textsuperscript{$-1$}, respectively. Trajectories were also run at collision energies of 35.3 and 50 kcal mol\textsuperscript{$-1$} for the $F^- + CH_3I$ reaction with $x$ set to 20 bohrs. $b$ was scanned from 0 to $b_{\text{max}}$ which is the maximum value of $b$, where any reactive event can occur, with a step size of 0.5 bohr, except at collision energies of 35.3 and 50 kcal.
mol$^{-1}$, where a smaller step size of 0.125 bohr was employed in order to get improved statistics for the spatial distributions of the nucleophile. At each $\theta$, 5000 trajectories were propagated, resulting in more than 2 million trajectories in this study. We also performed dynamics simulations for the mass-scaled reaction $F^+ + CH_3Cl$ by setting the mass of Cl$^-$ to 127 au and using the PES of $F^+ + CH_3Cl$. For the exothermic $F^+ + CH_3Y \rightarrow CH_3F + Y^- [Y = Cl, Br, I]$ substitution reactions, the zero-point energy violation is negligible, thus the QCT product analysis considered all the reactive trajectories. The spatial distributions of the $F^+$ nucleophile were obtained by the TOP method combined with the standard Histogram Analysis procedure.

ASSOCIATED CONTENT

Supporting Information
The Supporting Information is available free of charge on the ACS Publications website at DOI: 10.1021/acs.jpclett.7b01253.

Structures and relative energies of the Nu$^{--}YCH_3$ [Nu = F,Cl,Br,I; Y = Cl,Br,I] front-side complexes (Figure S1); molecular orbitals and atomic charges of the F$^+$ YCH$_3$ [Y = Cl,Br,I] front-side complexes (Figure S2); spatial probabilities of the F$^+$ nucleophile around CH$_3$Y [Y = Cl,Br,I] on the reactant side of the F$^+$ CH$_3Y \rightarrow CH_3F + Y^-$ [Y = Cl,Br,I] substitution reactions at different collision energies (Figures S3–6); classical energies of the Nu$^{--}YCH_3$ [Nu = F,Cl,Br,I; Y = Cl,Br,I] front-side complex minima (Table S1); harmonic vibrational frequencies for front-side complex minima (Table S2).

AUTHOR INFORMATION

Corresponding Authors
*E-mail: istvan.szabo@kcl.ac.uk (I.S.).
*E-mail: gczako@chem.u-szeged.hu (G.C.).

ORCID

István Szabó: 0000-0002-3700-3614
Gábor Czako: 0000-0001-5136-4777

Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I.S. was supported by the UK EPSRC Fellowship EP/N020669/1. G.C. was supported by the Scientific Research Fund of Hungary (PD-111900) and the János Bolyai Research Scholarship of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. We acknowledge the National Information Infrastructure Development Institute for awarding us access to resources based in Hungary at Debrecen and Szeged.

REFERENCES

(8) Szabó, I.; Czako, G. Revealing a Double-Inversion Mechanism for the F$^+ + CH_3Cl$ S$_2$2 Reaction. Nat. Commun. 2015, 6, 5972.
(10) Xie, J.; Hase, W. L. Rethinking the S$_2$2 Reaction. Science 2016, 352, 32–33.
(26) Frisch, M. J.; et al. Gaussian 09, revision E01; Gaussian, Inc.: Wallingford, CT, 2009.